

Possible Paths for Future Study

There are many gaps in this short history. In this concluding section I want to present a sampling of areas that merit further research for future inclusion in a more complete history of Marianist spirituality.

The Spirituality of 20th Century Marianist Educators. The years from World War I to the Second Vatican Council, roughly from 1920 to 1960, can be viewed as the summit of apostolic success by Marianist men and women religious in the networks of prosperous Catholic schools they conducted around the world. During those years Marianist religious led an active life that was divided between time spent in the school and time spent in the convent or faculty residence. Their spiritual life was nurtured by an apostolic zeal for the work of education being done with the students and by a rich round of prayers, spiritual exercises, practices, spiritual direction, spiritual reading almost all of which was carried on in the calm of the convent or faculty residence.¹ No

¹ Christopher Kauffman devotes several chapters of his history of the Society of Mary in North America to the years from 1920 to 1960, in which he describes the spirituality of American Marianist brothers and priests during the heyday of American Marianist schools. He treats this division of Marianist religious life between the school and the faculty residence. He sees the tension as sometimes almost contradictory or antagonistic. The attitude towards students and teaching in the school is world-accepting and world-embracing. The attitude in the faculty residence, on the other hand, is mistrustful and suspicious of the world; it is world-excluding and world-rejecting. He illustrates all these attitudes with copious direct quotations from original documents. He also advances a thesis that for American Marianists (that is, American members of the Society of Mary) the

one has yet examined the various components of this Marianist spirituality of Marianist religious during that era of greatest apostolic success in the schools to describe how its various components fit together. When those Marianists prayed or made meditation, what images and themes were the stuff of their prayer? When they prayed for their students or for one another, what spiritual sentiments filled their hearts? How did they experience their relationships with God, with Christ, with Mary? It would take much careful work by various historians in the different countries where Marianist religious flourished in those years to reconstruct this phase of the history of the Marianist spirituality of Marianist religious.

Marianist Vocal Prayers. This example suggests another. No one has yet made a systematic study of Marianist vocal prayers and their history. There are isolated articles scattered in Marianist periodicals such as the old *Apôtre de Marie* or the current *Marianist International Review* which tell the story of individual prayers such as the Little Office of the Immaculate Conception or the Three O'Clock Prayer. Father Armbruster, for example, wrote an article on the origins and evolution of the Three O'Clock Prayer;² and Father Lebon, among other authors, wrote various articles about Marianist prayers and devotions in the old *Apôtre de Marie*, of which he was the editor for many years. Other references are scattered in the appendixes and footnotes of Marianist documents on topics such as the various Acts of Consecration that have been used by Marianists over the years. Until the post-Vatican II shift to praying the Liturgy of the Hours, Marianist religious in the Daughters of Mary and the Society of Mary used

world-accepting and world-embracing spirituality of the school was far stronger and overcame the world-rejecting spirituality of the faculty residence.

See KAUFFMAN, *Education and Transformation*, chapters 6 and 7, pp. 163-236.

² Jean Baptiste ARMBRUSTER, SM, "La prière de trois heures: histoire et propositions", *Marianist International Review* no. 3 (April 1985), pp. 19-31.

special Marianist prayer books or formularies for their daily common recitation of prayers. These formularies went through many editions and revisions during the 150 years after 1816 and 1817. No one has yet made a systematic historical survey of these Marianist formularies. The history of Marianist vocal prayers fits into the history of Marianist devotions and spiritual practices, which, in turn, is an important component or theme in the history of Marianist spirituality.

National Embodiments of Marianist Spirituality. To give another example, the 1980s saw the publication of a spate of books and monographs in Spanish on the history of the Society in Spain to mark the Marianist centenary celebrations. Few people in the English-speaking Marianist world know the breadth, quantity, and quality of these publications. Even the beatification of our Spanish martyrs did not change this situation very much among English-speaking Marianists. The complex history of the Society in Spain recounted in these works includes many portrayals of the spirituality of Marianist religious and their students during the 100 years of Marianist presence. To my knowledge, no one has yet made a survey of these historical works and extracted a description and analysis of Spanish Marianist spirituality and its evolution across those 100 years. In a similar vein, no one has analyzed the evolution of Marianist spirituality among other nationalities. How, for example, have Italian Marianist spirituality or French Marianist spirituality or Austrian Marianist spirituality evolved in the course of Marianist history? When such histories of the various national Marianist spiritualities are written, it will be possible to make comparative studies of these national Marianist spiritualities. How, for example, has (North) American Marianist spirituality differed from Spanish Marianist spirituality? Has the American ethos colored Marianist spirituality in ways that can be distinguished from the ways the Spanish ethos has?

System of Virtues. A minor but important theme in Marianist spirituality is the System of Virtues. There has been a revival of sorts of the System of Virtues in some parts of the Marianist world during the last 40 years that dates at least as far back as the publication of the volumes of the *Écrits de Direction*. This revival is the most recent phase of the history of the System of Virtues. That history has not yet been systematically studied and a complete survey of that history is yet to be written. However, the broad outlines of that history can be gleaned from various sources.

It seems clear that the pattern of the history of the System of Virtues resembles and parallels the pattern of the history of the awareness of Father Chaminade among Marianists. During the foundation period, when Father Chaminade was alive and Marianists knew him directly and personally, the System of Virtues emerged at the time of the founding of the two religious congregations. It was well known and widely used by the Marianist religious of that epoch. They had direct, personal experience of the System through practices such as daily particular examen. Large portions of the *Grand Institut* are devoted to an exposition of the System. David Monier and Jean Baptiste Lalanne wrote their manuals of the System under Father Chaminade's guidance. In the early retreats of the Society, there were always daily conferences on various portions of the System.

Where did the System of Virtues come from? It appears to be an original invention of the Founder; he does not seem to have copied it from another source. Some students of the System speculate that certain spiritual writers may be singled out as remote sources or influences that suggested aspects of the System to the Founder. Father Robert E. Hughes (of the Pacific Province) has asked if Lorenzo Scupoli was perhaps a remote source or influence for the System. Germán Doig, one of the founders of the *Sodalitium Christianae Vitae* in Peru, has asked if Louis of Granada

was a remote source or influence.³ As late as the 1830s and 1840s Father Chaminade was putting finishing touches on the System. In the so-called *Premier Jet*⁴ he introduced the text of 2 Peter 1:5-8 as the scriptural basis of the System, and he continued to write outlines and partial drafts of a large Manual of Direction which, if it had been completed, was supposed to have included a section on the System.

After 1850, awareness of the Founder receded in the consciousness of Marianists, and similarly the System of Virtues fell into desuetude. The documents collected in the last volume of *Écrits de Direction* trace the gradual dilution and disappearance of awareness of the System of Virtues among Marianists. During the revival of awareness of the Founder after his biography was published in 1901, Marianists were also re-acquainted with the System of Virtues in various sections of the *Spirit of Our Foundation* and other published works. However, this revived awareness of the System was more theoretical than practical; it was not a return to the active use of the System of the foundation period.

The first half of the 20th century saw limited, sporadic, and partial rediscovery of the System. This rediscovery was concurrent with the rediscovery and growing awareness of Father Chaminade and his vision. Many Marianist novices were told about the Five Silences without necessarily learning that they were part of the System.⁵ Father Ferree gave a conference on the

³ Germán DOIG KLINGE, *Dos maestros espirituales: Guillermo José Chaminade y fray Luis de Granada* (Lima: Fondo Editorial, 1990).

⁴ Document V, §§ 1230-1243, pp. 365-70, in *ED 1* (Document 12, pp. 97-100, in *MD 2*, with historical introduction on pp. 366-70 of *MD 4*.) Also in *MO*, Document 14, pp. 97-100. Also in *Spirit 4*, Chapter 3, "The Formation of Candidates," § 85, pp. 213-16. Father Armbruster calls this document "the best and most complete summary left by the Founder" of the System of Virtues.

⁵ Father Neubert's very popular "Interior Life Book," which he composed during his sojourn in the United States, was used for many years in American Marianist novitiates. It contains a very good introductory explanation of the Five

System while he was a seminarian in Fribourg, which was committed to writing and widely circulated among American Marianist religious.⁶ Brother Greiner and Father Clemens wrote pamphlets on the System that were used by many American members of the Society in the years after World War II. During those years there was also renewal of interest in the System in the Fribourg seminary, which led to Father Armbruster editing and publishing the successive volumes of the *Écrits de Direction*. Since then the most prominent promoter of the System has probably been Father Hakenewerth, whose many books are used by both lay Marianists and religious Marianists. There is even a token reference⁷ to the System in the 1983 Rule of Life of the Society. This short review of the history of the System of Virtues gives only a few highlights. A systematic and well-researched account has yet to be written.

Rebirth of Marianist Lay Communities. To give yet another example of an unexplored area of the history of Marianist spirituality, no one has yet written a history of the rebirth of adult Marianist lay communities after World War II in the various countries and the evolution of Marianist spirituality that accompanied that growth. Father Benloch has provided us with a very

Silences, which are identified as Father Chaminade's theory of silence and the first of the preparation virtues. However, the other preparation virtues are not identified, and neither is the System of Virtues as a whole. See [Émile NEUBERT, SM], *A Study of the Interior Life According to the Spirit of the Society of Mary* (Kirkwood, Mo.: Maryhurst Press, 1959), §§ 360-75, pp. 114-20.

⁶ The conference was given in 1936. It comments on the following passage from a letter of the Founder to the novices of the Daughters of Mary in Agen: "In the Institute the virtues of preparation are those that formed great saints elsewhere; the virtues of purification are suggested to the predestined; and the third order of virtues, those of consummation, are the virtues of Jesus Christ and of Mary." See *Lettres 1*, January 10, 1822, no. 186a, p. 316. Also in *ED 1*, p. xlv, and in *MD 4*, p. 374.

⁷ *SM Rule*, art. 4.17. See also Serge Hospital, SM, "The System of Virtues," in *Commentary on SM Rule*, pp. 1145-72.

good preliminary account and survey of the recent *eclosión* of Marianist lay communities in his book *El mensaje Chaminade hoy*.⁸ He reproduces the chart of all Marianist lay communities in the world which was part of Father Hakenewerth's report to the SM General Chapter of 1986. At that time there were more than 300 groups with a total of about 6,500 members. Today, in 1999, the numbers are larger. To write the comprehensive history of the rebirth of Marianist lay communities throughout the world, it will be necessary to write the regional histories of the development in various countries. Brother García de Vinuesa's thesis includes an account of the start of CEMI in Spain, but does not give its subsequent history.⁹ Recent articles¹⁰ in the *Marianist International Review* treat the growth of Marianist lay communities in France,¹¹ Chile,¹² the Province of Saragossa,¹³ and the Province of Madrid.¹⁴ More regional histories need to be written to round out the full picture and prepare for a comprehensive history of the rebirth of Marianist lay communities since World War II. Perhaps these histories will be written by lay Marianists, which would surely

⁸ Eduardo BENLLOCH, SM, *El mensaje Chaminade hoy* (Madrid: Ediciones SM, 1987), chapter 5, pp. 121-42.

⁹ Francisco José GARCÍA DE VINUESA ZABALA, SM, *Relations of the Society of Mary with the Sodality-State*, MRC Monograph Series, Doc. 21 (Dayton, MRC, January 1977), chapter 3, pp. 121-64.

¹⁰ I am indebted to Father Benloch for calling my attention to these articles.

¹¹ Marie Laure JEAN, "Les fraternités marianistes de la Province de France (Retour aux sources et nouvelles moissons)," *Marianist International Review*, No. 1 (March 1984), pp. 52-70.

¹² Alvaro LAPEIRA, SM, and Francisco García de Vinuesa, SM, "Movimiento marianista en Chile," *Marianist International Review*, No. 2 (October 1984), pp. 60-75.

¹³ Mariano ZUAZO, SM, "Orígenes y formación de las Fraternidades marianistas de la Provincia de Zaragoza," *Marianist International Review*, No. 6 (October 1896), pp. 36-43.

¹⁴ Ignacio ZABALA, SM, "Nuestra colaboración con las fraternidades marianistas en la Provincia de Madrid," *Marianist International Review*, No. 9 (April 1988), pp. 18-30.

enrich the perspectives and widen the range of insights that would be contributed to the history of Marianist spirituality.

Spirituality of Marianist Religious After Vatican II. Another area yet to be studied is the tremendous shift in Marianist spirituality among Marianist men and women religious since the Second Vatican Council. This is the period in which new Rules of Life were adopted. Large scale changes inspired by the Council transformed the life of Marianist religious of the 1930s, 40s, and 50s into a totally new reality. This is also the period in which there has been a steady decrease in numbers among Marianist religious. Membership figures of the Marianist religious congregations are now less than half of what they were 30 years ago and the majority of today's members are old people. The Society of Mary and Daughters of Mary are no longer the successful, efficient teaching congregations they used to be before Vatican II. What has made up the spirituality of Marianist religious during these last 30 years of momentous change? What themes and images fill their prayer life? What spirituality of apostolic zeal do they have amid the withdrawal and retrenchment from the success and effectiveness of the past? How do they experience their relationships with God, with Christ, with Mary?

History of Formation of Marianist Religious. At the meeting of the authors of the Marianist spirituality writing project, Father Amigo pointed out that another area of future research that will shed light on the history of Marianist spirituality is a history of formation in the Society of Mary and Daughters of Mary. Such a history will clarify how our spirituality was taught and practiced. Who, for example, were the outstanding Masters or Mistresses of Novices, and what did they emphasize in the teaching and direction they provided? What textbooks, manuals, and other documents have been used in the formation of Marianist religious? Who wrote them and what sort of portrayal of Marianist spirituality did they contain?

Mary in Recent Marianist Spirituality. A crucially important aspect of the post-Vatican II shift in Marianist spirituality concerns our devotion to Mary. No one has yet undertaken a systematic study of what changes occurred and how they transpired. Nevertheless, it is possible to propose some impressions that could serve as hypotheses for verification by good historical research. It appears that devotion to Mary has remained strong among Marianists during the 30 odd years since Vatican II. However, it also seems to have changed in tone. The language and theological conceptual framework within which it is expressed seems more focused on Mary as the first disciple and a model of Christian life and faith. At the same time there seems to be a greater use of the explicit ideas and language of Father Chaminade in texts such as the acts of the Society's General Chapter of 1971 and in the new Rules of Life of the Society and the Daughters of Mary. Despite this trend, there also seems to be less emphasis on Mary's spiritual maternity. Marianist thought on Mary seems to rely more on solid scripture scholarship. Unlike the tendency among progressive Catholics right after Vatican II to downplay Mary in Catholic spirituality, Marianists continued to give her a central prominence in Marianist spirituality. And unlike the more recent tendency among traditional Catholics to find great inspiration in reported Marian apparitions, most Marianists seem to maintain a respectful but neutral stance on the subject of Marian apparitions and private revelations.

Marianist Spirituality Beyond Europe and North America. This short history of Marianist spirituality has concentrated on Europe and North America, a concentration that is one more inadequacy of this paper. A full telling of the history will have to cover the development of Marianist spirituality in Japan, in Latin America, in Korea, in French-speaking and English-speaking Africa, and in India. The Marianist historians who undertake this work will no doubt be natives of the countries and continents about which they write.

The French School of Spirituality. This paper has not treated the important ways in which Marianist spirituality lies within the broad stream of the French School of Spirituality. This is due to the fact that I was told to leave aside this theme in my paper because it would be treated by one of the other authors in the Marianist spirituality writing project. In fact, due to certain misunderstandings, this did not happen. Therefore, it must be acknowledged at the end of this paper, that one of its serious lacunae is the absence of an account of the way the French School contributed to the development of Marianist spirituality. A future comprehensive history of Marianist spirituality will have to include such an account.

* * *

This quick survey of possible topics for future research and study indicates subjects that will figure in a history of Marianist spirituality that is more adequate and more complete than the preliminary effort presented in this paper. We look forward to the day when these possibilities will be realized.

Appendix: Critique of Father Benlloch

The first version of this paper was submitted for review to two readers: Father Théodore Koehler and Father Eduardo Benlloch. Father Benlloch submitted his comments in March 1999. His critique of the section entitled "Development of Marianist Spirituality after 1850" includes the following passage in which he summarizes his own theory of two traditions in Marianist spirituality which account for the rise and fall of "filial piety" as well as the changes which have taken place from Father Simler's time to our own day. The original Spanish text of Father Benlloch is followed by my translation.

Me parece que he vivido el último esplendor triunfal de la llamada *piedad filial* y en el creciente abandono de esa misma expresión y su contenido, al mismo tiempo que se iba recuperando una tradición espiritual más directamente inspirada en el P. Chaminade.

Yo he llegado a la conclusión de que han existido dos tradiciones espirituales en la historia de la espiritualidad marianista, que sucintamente explico así.

1. Una relectura de Chaminade que empieza con Simler y pasa por E. Neubert y Paul-Marie Verrier. Según esta tradición, *nuestro don de Dios es el voto de estabilidad*.

Tienden a hacer del voto de estabilidad una consagración directa a la Santísima Virgen. La *piedad filial* para ellos es más bien

una actitud personal con una cierta carga de sentimentalismo. Quedan bastante oscurecidas y relegadas las dimensiones comunitaria y misionera de nuestra alianza con María. Es curioso ver cómo en el famoso Capítulo XXX de las Constituciones de 1891 no se habla para nada de la misión ni de que el hijo de María es esencialmente misionero.

El escrito del P. Joseph Verrier citado más arriba nos cuenta la insistencia y las consultas tenaces al Vaticano y a teólogos que hizo el P. Paul-Marie Verrier para justificar su explicación del *voto de estabilidad* como la expresión de una consagración directa a la Santísima Virgen. Las respuestas fueron siempre claras negando tajantemente esta explicación. También reproduce una serie de cartas que se cruzaron entre marianistas de aquella época con respecto a esa polémica: el mismo P. Joseph Verrier, el P. Resch, el P. Hoffer, el P. Neubert.

El exponente más claro y más divulgado de esta postura es el libro del P. E. Neubert *Mon idéal, Jésus Fils de Marie*.

2. Hay otra tradición que va quedando en la obscuridad desde 1850, olvidada o relegada por la creciente extensión e inflación de la *piEDAD filial*. Esta tradición se empieza a recuperar, cada vez con más fuerza, a partir de los años cincuenta del siglo XX, debido a una serie de causas, entre las que podemos citar:

— El creciente interés por los escritos del P. Chaminade mismo. En Friburgo se empiezan a publicar y a divulgar. Se olvida *L'esprit de notre fondation* y se empiezan a sacar *Les écrits de direction, Les écrits marials, Les écrits d'oraison, Les notes d'instruction...*

— Varios seminaristas hacen tesis doctorales sobre los escritos del P. Chaminade mismo. Creo que es de justicia hablar de la tesis del P. Thomas Stanley, SM, *The mystical Body of Christ, according to the writings of Father William Joseph Chaminade* (1952), casi tan importante por su contenido sobre el cuerpo místico como por la descripción e intento de clasificación de los escritos del P. Chaminade.

— El mismo P. Joseph Verrier guía, con su enseñanza y con sus escritos, a un conocimiento directo del P. Chaminade.

— Yo mismo he sido testigo de los intentos de justificación teológica y canónica de la llamada *piEDAD filial* y del *voto de estabilidad como consagración directa a María*. Estos intentos se saldaron siempre en fracasos. No se pudo encontrar ninguna fundamentación teológica ni canónica. Todo esto dio como resultado un creciente interés por destacar los aspectos comunitarios y misioneros de nuestra alianza con María.

— El Capítulo General de 1966-67 y, sobre todo el de 1971, apoyan una clara recuperación de la lectura más auténtica y directa del pensamiento y de la espiritualidad del P. Chaminade.

— Creo que el exponente más claro de esta otra tradición es la *Regla de Vida* de 1983 (Véase especialmente *Nuestros orígenes, los aa. 5, 6, 7, 8, 14, 15, el capítulo V...*)

La postura del P. Joseph Verrier es clara: *nuestro don de Dios es la naturaleza mariana de la Compañía de María*.

El voto de estabilidad no es por sí mismo mariano. Tiene carácter mariano al vincular con la Compañía de María. Indirectamente es, por lo tanto, una consagración a María porque nos vincula a una congregación religiosa, que es esencialmente mariana.

En esta tradición se destaca fuertemente el carácter comunitario de nuestra consagración a María, *nuestra Madre* (y no mi Madre). También se pone de manifiesto la dimensión radicalmente misionera de nuestra alianza con María.

Creo sinceramente que esta tradición nos vincula mucho más al *carisma fundacional* del P. Chaminade. Por otra parte, es muy fácil aplicarla hoy a toda la *Familia Marianista*. María nos escoge a todos los marianistas (seglares y religiosos) para hacernos su *Familia* y colaborar con ella en su misión. Pero si nuestro don de Dios es el voto de estabilidad, ¿qué pasa con los marianistas seglares? Hay que reconocer que en la época de la *piEDAD filial* no existía *Familia Marianista*, como hoy la conocemos. A medida que

iban surgiendo las comunidades laicas marianistas se iba robusteciendo más y más esta otra tradición.

* * *

It seems to me that I lived through the final triumphal splendor of so-called *filial piety* and in the growing abandonment of this same expression and its contents, at the same time that there has been a recovery of a spiritual tradition more directly inspired by Father Chaminade.

I have come to the conclusion that there have existed two spiritual traditions in the history of Marianist spirituality, which I explain succinctly as follows:

1. A new reading of Chaminade which begins with Simler and passes through E. Neubert and Paul Marie Verrier. According to this tradition, *our gift from God is the vow of stability*.

They tried to make the vow of stability into a direct consecration to the most Blessed Virgin. According to them *filial piety* is much more of a personal attitude with a definite stress on sentimentality. The communitarian and missionary dimensions of our alliance with Mary remain for the most part in obscurity and side-lined. It is curious to see how in the famous Chapter 30 of the Constitutions of 1891, nothing is said about the mission nor about the son of Mary being essentially missionary.

The writing of Father Joseph Verrier cited above recounts the insistent and tenacious consultations at the Vatican and with theologians which Father Paul Marie Verrier made in order to justify his explanation of the vow of stability as the expression of a direct consecration to the most Blessed Virgin. The answers were always clear, denying absolutely this explanation. The au-

thor also reproduces a series of letters exchanged among Marianists of this period with respect to this polemic: Father Joseph Verrier himself, Father Resch, Father Hoffer, and Father Neubert.

The clearest and most widespread example of this position is Father Neubert's book *Mon idéal, Jésus Fils de Marie*.

2. There is another tradition which remained in obscurity after 1850, forgotten and set aside by the growing extension and inflation of *filial piety*. Beginning in the 1950s, this tradition begins to recover, each time with more force, due to a series of causes among which it is possible to cite:

— The growing interest in the writings of Father Chaminade himself. These began to be published and distributed in Fribourg. The *Spirit of Our Foundation* is forgotten, and *Les écrits de direction*, *Les écrits marials*, *Les écrits d'oraison*, *Les notes d'instruction*, ... begin to come out.

— Various seminarians write doctoral theses on the writings of Father Chaminade himself. I believe we can say with justice that the thesis of Father Thomas Stanley, SM, *The Mystical Body of Christ According to the Writings of Father William Joseph Chaminade* (1952), is almost as important for its content about the Mystical Body as it is for the description and attempt to classify the writings of Father Chaminade.

— Father Joseph Verrier himself, by his teaching and by his writings, guides us to a direct knowledge of Father Chaminade.

— I myself have witnessed the attempts to give a theological and canonical justification to so-called *filial piety* and the vow of stability as a direct consecration to Mary. These attempts have always ended in disaster. There was no theological or canonical foundation to be found. All of this resulted in a growing interest to stress the communitarian and missionary aspects of our alliance with Mary.

— The General Chapters of 1966-67 and, above all, of 1971

support a clear recovery of a more authentic and direct reading of the thought and spirituality of Father Chaminade.

— I believe that the clearest example of this other tradition is the Rule of Life of 1983 (See especially "Our Origins," articles 5, 6, 7, 8, 14, 15, and chapter 5.)

The position of Father Joseph Verrier is clear: *our gift from God is the Marian nature of the Society of Mary.*

The vow of stability is not by itself Marian. It takes on a Marian character by its link with the Society of Mary. It is, therefore, indirectly a consecration to Mary because it links us to a religious congregation which is essentially Marian.

This tradition stresses strongly the communitarian character of our consecration to Mary, *our Mother* (and not my Mother). It also is able to show the radically missionary dimension of our alliance with Mary.

I believe sincerely that this tradition links us much more to the *founding charism* of Father Chaminade. On the other hand it is much easier to apply to the whole Marianist Family today. Mary chooses all of us Marianists (secular and religious) to make us her Family and to collaborate with her in her mission. But if our gift from God is the vow of stability, what happens with secular Marianists? It must be remembered that in the time of *filial piety* the Marianist Family as we now know it did not exist. To the extent that Marianist lay communities have been emerging this other tradition has been getting stronger and stronger.

Bibliography

- ALBANO, Ambrogio, SM, editor. *Commentary on the Rule of Life of the Society of Mary*. Dayton: NACMS, 1994. [Abbreviated as *Commentary on SM Rule*.] Originally published in French as *Dictionnaire de la Règle de Vie marianiste* (Rome: CEMAR, 1988). Published in Spanish as *Diccionario de la Regla de Vida Marianista* (Madrid: Imprenta SM, 1990).
- ARMBRUSTER, Jean Baptiste, SM. *Devotion to Mary in Chaminade's Life and Thought*. Cupertino, California: Marianist Province of the Pacific, 1998. Translation of "Le caractère propre de la dévotion mariale enseignée et vécue par le Vénérable G.-Joseph Chaminade (1761-1850) et ses disciples, les Marianistes," a paper delivered at the 10th International Mariological Congress in Kevelaer, West Germany, on September 11, 1987.
- *L'État religieux marianiste: Étude et commentaire de la Lettre du 24 août 1839*. Paris: Marianistes (44, rue de la Santé), 1989. ST: *El estado religioso marianista. Estudio y comentario de la carta del padre Chaminade, el 24 de agosto de 1839, a los predicadores de Ejercicios de ese año*. Madrid, n.p., 1995. ET: available in manuscript at NACMS.
- "Marie dans les derniers temps chez le Père G.-Joseph Chaminade," in *Marie et la fin des temps*, vol. 3 (Approche historico-théologique), *Études mariales: Bulletin de la Société française d'études mariales* 43rd year (Paris: Éditions de l'O.E.I.L., 1987), pp. 67-81. ET: available in manuscript at NACMS.
- "La prière de trois heures: histoire et propositions," *Marianist International Review* No. 3 (April 1985), pp. 19-31. ET: available in manuscript at NACMS.

— *To Know, to Love, to Serve Mary with William Joseph Chaminade*. Monograph Series Document No. 32. Dayton: MRC, November 1986. Translation of *Avec G.-Joseph Chaminade, Connaître, Aimer, Servir Marie*. Paris: Marianistes (44, rue de la Santé), 1982.

[ARNAIZ, José María, SM.] "Camino marianista de vida cristiana," *Marianist International Review* no.13.2 (July 1992). Also in CADA, *Promised Woman*, pp. 565-97. ET: "The Marianist Way of Living the Christian Life," in CADA, *Promised Woman*, pp. 535-64.

BENLOCH, Eduardo, SM, *El mensaje Chaminade hoy*. Madrid: Ediciones SM, 1987. ET: available in manuscript at NACMS.

BOUYER, Louis, et al. *A History of Christian Spirituality*, 3 vols. London: Burns & Oates, 1968.

— *An Introduction to Spirituality*. New York: Desclée, 1961.

BREMOND, Henri. *Histoire littéraire du Sentiment religieux en France depuis la fin des guerres de religion jusqu'à nos jours*, 11 vols. Paris: Bloud et Gay, 1916-33. ET of first 3 volumes: *A Literary History of Religious Thought in France*, 3 vols. London: SPCK, 1928, 1930, 1936.

CADA, Lawrence J., SM, *Early Members of the Society of Mary*. Monograph Series No. 40. Dayton: NACMS, 1999.

CADA, Lawrence, SM, editor. *The Promised Woman: Proceedings of the International Symposium on Marianist Spirituality*, May 5-13, 1992, Dayton, Ohio, USA. Monograph Series No. 37. Dayton: NACMS, March 1995.

CARDENAS, Emilio, SM. *150 Años de estudio de la mariología de Guillermo José Chaminade (1850)*. Czestochowa (Poland), January 1998. [Partial draft of a work in progress.]

CHAMINADE, William Joseph. *Écrits de Direction*, 3 vols. Edited by Jean Baptiste Armbruster, SM. Fribourg: Séminaire Marianiste, 1956 (vol. 1), 1964 (vol. 2, 2nd edition), 1960 (vol. 3). [Abbreviated as ED 1, ED 2, and ED 3.] ET: MD 1, MD 2, MD 3, and MD 4. ST: *Escritos de Dirección*, 3 vols. Madrid: Ediciones SM,

1964. [Note: ED 1 = MD 1 + MD 2; ED 2, eq MD 3; and ED 3 = MD 4.]

— *Écrits et Paroles*. Edited by Jean Baptiste Armbruster, SM, Serge Hospital, SM, and Emile Wertz, SM. Vol. 1 (Le temps des laïcs: La Congrégation de Bordeaux), Vol. 2 (Le temps des laïcs: Les notes d'instruction), and Vol. 5 (Le temps des religieux: Les fondations). Casale Monferrato (Italy): Piemme, 1994, 1999, and 1996. [Abbreviated as *Écrits et Paroles* 1, 2, 5.]

— *Écrits sur la foi*. Edited by Jean Baptiste Armbruster, SM. Paris: Marianistes (44, rue de la Santé), 1992. ET: available in manuscript at NACMS.

— *Lettres de M. Chaminade*. Vols. 1-5 - Nivelles (Belgium): Havaux, 1930-34. Vols.6-8 - Rome: Éditions AGMAR, 1977-79. [Abbreviated as *Lettres* 1, 2, 3, etc.] ET: *Letters of Father Chaminade*. Dayton: MRC, 1972-86

— *Marian Writings*, 2 vols. Edited by Jean Baptiste Armbruster, SM. Dayton: MRC, 1980. [Abbreviated as MW 1 and MW 2.] Translation of *Écrits Marials*, 2 vols. Edited by J. B. Armbruster, SM. Fribourg: Séminaire Marianiste, 1966. ST: *Escritos Marianos*, 2 vols. Madrid: Ediciones SM, 1968

— *Marianist Direction*, 4 vols. Edited by Jean Baptiste Armbruster, SM. Vols. 1-3 (Dayton: Marianist Publications, 1966-69). Vol. 4 (Dayton: MRC, 1981). [Abbreviated as MD 1, MD 2, MD 3, and MD 4.] Translation of ED 1, ED 2, and ED 3. ST: *Escritos de Dirección*, 3 vols. Madrid: Ediciones SM, 1964. [Note: MD 1 + MD 2 = ED 1; MD 3 = ED 2; and MD 4 = ED 3.]

— *Notes de retraites prêchées par G.-Joseph Chaminade (1809-1843)*, 3 vols. Edited by Léo Pauels, SM. Fribourg: Séminaire Marianiste, 1964. ET: available in manuscript at NACMS.

— *Writings on Mental Prayer*. Edited by Raymond Halter, SM. Dayton: MRC, 1979. [Abbreviated as WMP.] Translation of *Écrits d'Oraison*. Edited by Raymond Halter, SM. Fribourg: Séminaire Marianiste, 1969. ST: *Escritos de oración*. Madrid: Ediciones SM, 1975.

- COLE, William J., SM. *The Spiritual Maternity of Mary According to the Writings of Father William Joseph Chaminade: A Study of His Spiritual Doctrine*. Cincinnati, n.p., 1958.
- Constitutions of 1839 (of the SM)*. Dayton: Apostle of Mary Documentary Series, 1949.
- Constitutions of 1891 (of the SM)*. Dayton, n.p., 1937
- Constitutions of 1967 (of the SM)*. St. Louis, n.p. (printed by Marhurst Press), 1967
- [COULON, Joseph, SM.] *R. P. Henri Lebon*. Besançon: Imprimerie de l'Est, 1949.
- [COUSIN, Louis, SM.] *Joseph Simler, Fourth Superior General of the Society of Mary, Biographical Sketch by a Member of the Same Society*. Dayton: Brothers of Mary, St. Mary's Convent, 1913. Translation of *Joseph Simler, IV e Supérieur général de la Société de Marie, Notice biographique par un membre de la même Société*. Paris: Librairie Saint-Paul 1905.
- DÉLAS, Jean Claude, SM, *Histoire des Constitutions de la Société de Marie*. Fribourg: Études marianistes, 1964. ST: *Historia de las Constituciones de la Compañía de María*. Madrid: Ediciones SM, 1965. ET: *History of the Constitutions of the Society of Mary*, MRC Monograph Series Doc. 19. Dayton: MRC, April 1975.
- "Rule of Life," in *Commentary on SM Rule*, pp. 1045-70.
- DOIG KLINGE, Germán. *Dos maestros espirituales: Guillermo José Chaminade y fray Luis de Granada*. Lima: Fondo Editorial, 1990
- II Encuentro Internacional de Comunidades laicas marianistas*. 3-10 Agosto, 1997. [Proceedings of the 2nd International Convocation of Marianist Lay Communities, August 3-10, 1997.] Liria, Valencia (Spain): n.p., 1997.
- FERRERO, Bruno, SM. "Evoluzione del pensiero mariano nella storia della Società di Maria," *Quaderni Marianisti*, No. 23. Marianisti: Provincia Italiana, 1965.
- FLEMING, David A., SM. "Mission," in *Commentary on SM Rule*, pp. 831-54.

- [FONTAINE, Jean Baptiste, SM.] *Manual of Christian Pedagogy for the Use of the Brothers of Mary*. Dayton: Nazareth, 1899. A free translation of 1st volume of the French original published in Bordeaux by Gounouilhou et Lafargue in 1856-57.
- [GADIOU, Louis, SM.] *La Société de Marie (Marianistes)*. Paris: Letouzey et Ané, 1930.
- GADIOU, Louis, SM, and Jean Claude Délas, SM. *Marianistes en mission permanente*. Paris: Marianistes, 1972. ET: *Marianists in a Continuing Mission*. St. Louis: MRC, 1973.
- GARCÍA DE VINUESA ZABALA, Francisco José, SM. "The Family of Mary," in *Commentary on SM Rule*, pp. 442-75.
- *Relations of the Society of Mary with the Sodality-State According to the Writings of William J. Chaminade*, MRC Monograph Series, Document 21. Dayton: MRC, January 1977.
- GASCÓN, Antonio, SM. *Defender y proponer la fe en la enseñanza de Guillermo José Chaminade*. Espiritualidad marianista no. 13. Madrid: Servicio de Publicaciones Marianistas, 1998.
- "Defender y proponer la fe en la enseñanza del P. Chaminade," *Marianist International Review* no. 17.1-2 (April 1996).
- [GIRARDET, François, SM] *The Secret of Becoming Better or a Series of Meditations on the Principal Truths and Virtues of the Christian and Religious Life*. Dayton: St. Mary's Institute, 1885. Translation of *L'art de devenir meilleur*.
- HAKENEWERTH, Quentin, SM, editor. *Marianist Origins: An Anthology of Basic Documents for Formation in Marianist Identity*. Rome: n.p., 1990. [Abbreviated as MO.]
- HAZARD, Paul. *La crise de la conscience européenne, 1685-1715*. Paris: Boivin, 1935. ET: *The European Mind: The Critical Years 1680-1715*. New York: Fordham University Press, 1990.
- *La Pensée européenne au XVIII^e siècle*, 2 vols. Paris: Boivin, 1946.
- HOFFER, Paul Joseph, SM. *The Spiritual Life According to the Writings of Father Chaminade*. [St. Louis: MRC, 1969. Published without attribution of publisher on title page.] Translation of

- La vie spirituelle d'après les écrits du Père Chaminade.* Rome: Marianistes, n.d.
- HOSPITAL, Serge, SM. "System of Virtues," in *Commentary on SM Rule*, pp. 1145-72.
- JEAN, Marie Laure. "Les fraternités marianistes de la Province de France (Retour aux sources et nouvelles moissons)," *Marianist International Review* No. 1 (March 1984), pp.52-70.
- KAUFFMAN, Christopher J. *Education and Transformation: Marianist Ministries in America Since 1849.* New York: Crossroad Publishing Company, 1999
- KLOBB, Charles, SM. *L'Esprit de la Société: Retraite de Fayt, Semaine de Pâques 1905.* Rome: AGMAR Collection "La Gerbe," No. 9, 1999.
- [KLOBB, Charles, SM, and Henri Lebon, SM.] *The Spirit of Our Foundation: According to the Writings of Father Chaminade and of Our First Members in (the Original Documents of) the Society*, 4 vols. Vol. 1 - Dayton: St. Mary's Convent, 1911. Vols. 2, 3 - Dayton: Mount St. John Normal School, 1916-20. Vol. 4 - St. Louis: Marianist Resources Commission, 1977. [Abbreviated as *Spirit 1, 2, 3, and 4.*] The first 3 volumes are a translation of *l'Esprit de notre Fondation*, 3 vols. Nivelles (Belgium): Imprimerie Havaux-Houdart, 1910-16.
- KOEHLER, Théodore, SM. "Neubert (Émile), marianiste, 1878-1967," in *Dictionnaire de Spiritualité*, vol. 11 (Paris: Beauchesne, 1982), cols. 151-52.
- LACKNER, Joseph H., SM. *William Joseph Chaminade, His Apostolic Intent and His Engagement with Schools, Instruction, and Education: An Historical Portrait.* Monograph Series No. 42. Dayton: NACMS, 1999
- LAPETRA, Álvaro, SM, and Francisco García de Vinuesa, SM. "Movimiento marianista en Chile," *Marianist International Review* No. 2 (October 1984), pp. 60-75.
- [LEBON, Henri, SM.] *Répertoire des principaux documents publiés dans*

- la Société de Marie jusqu'au 31 décembre 1938.* Nivelles (Belgium): Havaux, n.d.
- LEIES, John G., SM *History of Our Apostolic Devotion to Mary.* Dayton: Apostle of Mary Documentary Series (Vol. 1, No. 5, Document 4405), May 1944.
- McCOOL, Gerald A., SJ. *Catholic Theology in the Nineteenth Century: The Quest for a Unitary Method.* New York: Seabury (Crossroad), 1977.
- NEUBERT, Émile, SM. *My Ideal, Jesus Son of Mary: According to the Spirit of William Joseph Chaminade.* Kirkwood, Mo.: Maryhurst Press, 1952.
- *Our Gift from God.* St. Louis: n.p., 1962. Translation of *Notre don de Dieu.* Tours (France): Éditions Mame, 1953
- *Le Père Joseph Schellhorn, Marianiste: Un prêtre de Marie (1869-1935).* Paris: Centre de Documentation scolaire, 1948.
- [—] *A Study of the Interior Life According to the Spirit of the Society of Mary.* Kirkwood, Mo.: Maryhurst Press, 1959.
- *Synthesis of Our Characteristic Traits and of Our Obligations.* Mount St. John (Dayton): Apostle of Mary Documentary Series, 1945. Translation of *Synthèse de nos traits caractéristiques et de nos obligations.* Nivelles (Belgium): Imprimerie Havaux, 1940.
- PIERREL, Philippe, SM. *A Missionary Journey with William Joseph Chaminade, Founder of the Marianists: 1761-1850.* Dayton: MRC, 1986. Translation of *Sur les chemins de la mission... G. Joseph Chaminade, fondateur des Marianistes (1761- 1850).* Pro manuscripto [Paris: Marianistes (44, rue de la Santé), 1981.] ST: *Por los caminos de la misión. Guillermo José Chaminade, misionero apostólico.* Madrid: Servicio de Publicaciones Marianistas, 1993.
- POURRAT, Pierre, SS. *La Spiritualité chrétienne*, 4 vols. Paris: Victor Lecoffre, 1918-28. ET: *Christian Spirituality*, 4 vols. Westminster, Maryland: Newman Press, 1953-55.
- Rule of Life of the Society of Mary.* Dayton: n.p., 1983. [Abbreviated as *SM Rule.*]

- SSCHELLHORN, Joseph, SM. *The Little Treatise on Mariology*. Dayton: Apostle of Mary Documentary Series, August and November 1951. Translation of *Petit Traité de Mariologie*. Turnhout (Belgium): H. Proost & Cie., 1933.
- SHELDRAKE, Philip, SJ. *Spirituality and History: Questions of Interpretation and Method*. New York: Crossroad, 1992.
- SIMLER, Joseph, SM. "Historical Notice of the Society of Mary," *Circular No. 55*, March 12, 1891 (Dayton, St. Mary's Convent, 1893).
- "Instruction on Piety," *Circular No. 10*, June 28, 1878, 2 parts (Dayton: Apostle of Mary Documentary Series, March 1952). Each of the 2 parts of the 1952 ET has its own separate pagination. An abridged English translation of this circular was published as *Filial Piety in Christian Life* (Dayton: St. Mary's Institute, 1881).
- "Instruction on the Characteristic Features of the Society of Mary on the Occasion of the First Centenary of Its Origin," *Circular No. 62*, July 10, 1894 (Dayton: St. Mary's Convent, 1895).
- *Journal intime et notes*. Edited by Ambrogio Albano, SM. Rome: AGMAR Collection "La Gerbe," No. 5, 1996.
- *William Joseph Chaminade: Founder of the Marianists*. Dayton: MRC, 1986. Translation of *Guillaume-Joseph Chaminade: Fondateur de la Société de Marie et de l'Institut des Filles de Marie*. Paris and Bordeaux: Victor Lecoffre and Féret et fils, 1901.
- STANLEY, Thomas A., SM. *The Mystical Body of Christ According to the Writings of Father William Joseph Chaminade: A Study of His Spiritual Doctrine*. Fribourg: St. Paul's Press, 1952.
- STEFANELLI, Joseph, SM. *Mlle de Lamourous: A Resource on Marie Thérèse Charlotte de Lamourous*. Dayton: NACMS, 1998.
- TANQUEREY, Adolph A., SS. *The Spiritual Life*. Tournai (Belgium): Desclée, 1930. Translation of *Précis de Théologie ascétique et mystique*. Paris and Tournai (Belgium): Desclée, 1923.

- VASEY, Vincent R., SM. *Chaminade: Another Portrait*. Dayton: MRC, 1987.
- VERRIER, Joseph, SM. *Jalons d'histoire sur la route de Guillaume-Joseph Chaminade*, 4 vols. Rome: CEMAR Marianist Center for Research and Development, 1977-84. Page numbers refer to the reprint of the Province of France. [Abbreviated as *Jalons 1, 2, 3, and 4.*] ET: available in manuscript at NACMS.
- "Marianist Stability," in *Commentary on SM Rule*, pp.740-52.
- "Notre Don de Dieu." Unpublished manuscript of 55 pages. Completed in Rome, January 10, 1984. Copy obtained from Eduardo Benlloch, SM; available at NACMS research library.
- VERRIER, Paul, SM. *Charles Klobb: Apôtre du P. Chaminade*. Rome: AGMAR Collection "La Gerbe," No. 9, 1999.
- *Sketches on the Original Meaning and the Changes in Our Vow of Stability*. Dayton: Apostle of Mary Documentary Series, November 1949.
- WINDISCH, Adolf M., SM. *The Marianist Social System According to the Writings of William Joseph Chaminade: 1761-1850*. Fribourg: St. Paul's Press, 1964.
- ZABALA, Ignacio, SM. "Nuestra colaboración con las fraternidades marianistas en la Provincia de Madrid," *Marianist International Review* No. 9 (April 1988), pp. 18-30.
- ZUAZO, Mariano, SM. "Orígenes y formación de las fraternidades marianistas de la Provincia de Zaragoza," *Marianist International Review* No. 6 (October 1986), pp. 36-43.

Colección
TEOLOGÍA MODERNA
Y ESPIRITUALIDAD MARIANISTA
(Títulos publicados o de próxima publicación)

1

LAWRENCE CADA
Historia de la Espiritualidad marianista

2

JOSÉ RAMÓN GARCÍA-MURGA
*Jesucristo, Hijo de María Mujer en Misión,
Figura de la Iglesia*

3

J. MCGRATH
*Historia de la reflexión teológica
de los siglos XIX y XX*

4

JOHANN ROTEN
*Eclesiología moderna y reflexión marianista
sobre la Iglesia*

5

H. BIHL
*Antropología actual y reflexión marianista
sobre el hombre*

6

E. ARENS
*Cristología actual y elementos de una
cristología de los marianistas*

7

LORENZO AMIGO
*Teología de la vida religiosa y aportación
marianista a esta teología*

8

VARIOS AUTORES
*Formación marianista:
Objetivos, contenidos y método
para esta formación*

